

## DOCUMENT A/65/10\*

### **Report of the International Law Commission on the work of its sixty-second session (3 May–4 June and 5 July–6 August 2010)**

#### CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Abbreviations.....	6
Note concerning quotations .....	6
Multilateral instruments cited in the present volume.....	7
 <i>Chapter</i>	
	<i>Paragraphs</i>
I. ORGANIZATION OF THE SESSION .....	1–11 11
A. Membership.....	2 11
B. Casual vacancy .....	3 11
C. Officers and Enlarged Bureau.....	4–6 11
D. Drafting Committee.....	7–8 12
E. Working Groups and Study Groups.....	9 12
F. Secretariat.....	10 13
G. Agenda.....	11 13
II. SUMMARY OF THE WORK OF THE COMMISSION AT ITS SIXTY-SECOND SESSION .....	12–24 14
III. SPECIFIC ISSUES ON WHICH COMMENTS WOULD BE OF PARTICULAR INTEREST TO THE COMMISSION .....	25–28 16
A. Reservations to treaties.....	25 16
B. Treaties over time .....	26–28 16
IV. RESERVATIONS TO TREATIES.....	29–106 17
A. Introduction .....	29–32 17
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session.....	33–104 17
1. Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of the second addendum to his fourteenth report and of his fifteenth report .....	47–78 19
2. Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of his sixteenth report.....	79–103 26
3. Content of the final report on the topic.....	104 31
C. Text of the set of draft guidelines constituting the Guide to Practice on Reservations to Treaties provisionally adopted by the Commission .....	105–106 31
1. Text of the set of draft guidelines .....	105 31
2. Text of the draft guidelines and commentaries thereto provisionally adopted by the Commission at its sixty-second session .....	106 46
2.6.3 Freedom to formulate objections .....	46
2.6.4 Freedom to oppose the entry into force of the treaty <i>vis-à-vis</i> the author of the reservation .....	48
3.3.2 [3.3.3] Effect of individual acceptance of an impermissible reservation .....	50
3.3.3 [3.3.4] Effect of collective acceptance of an impermissible reservation .....	51
3.4 Permissibility of reactions to reservations .....	53
3.4.1 Permissibility of the acceptance of a reservation.....	53
3.4.2 Permissibility of an objection to a reservation.....	54
3.5 Permissibility of an interpretative declaration .....	57
3.5.1 Permissibility of an interpretative declaration which is in fact a reservation .....	60
[3.5.2 Conditions for the permissibility of a conditional interpretative declaration].....	61
[3.5.3 Competence to assess the permissibility of a conditional interpretative declaration] .....	62

\* Initially distributed as *Official Records of the General Assembly, Sixty-fifth Session, Supplement No. 10.*

	Page
3.6 Permissibility of reactions to interpretative declarations.....	63
3.6.1 Permissibility of approvals of interpretative declarations .....	63
3.6.2 Permissibility of oppositions to interpretative declarations.....	64
4. Legal effects of reservations and interpretative declarations.....	64
4.1 Establishment of a reservation with regard to another State or organization .....	67
4.1.1 Establishment of a reservation expressly authorized by a treaty .....	70
4.1.2 Establishment of a reservation to a treaty which has to be applied in its entirety .....	72
4.1.3 Establishment of a reservation to a constituent instrument of an international organization .....	74
4.2 Effects of an established reservation.....	75
4.2.1 Status of the author of an established reservation.....	75
4.2.2 Effect of the establishment of a reservation on the entry into force of a treaty .....	78
4.2.3 Effect of the establishment of a reservation on the status of the author as a party to the treaty.....	79
4.2.4 Effect of an established reservation on treaty relations .....	79
4.2.5 Non-reciprocal application of obligations to which a reservation relates.....	85
4.3 Effect of an objection to a valid reservation .....	87
4.3.1 Effect of an objection on the entry into force of the treaty as between the author of the objection and the author of a reservation.....	88
4.3.2 Entry into force of the treaty between the author of a reservation and the author of an objection.....	89
4.3.3 Non-entry into force of the treaty for the author of a reservation when unanimous acceptance is required.....	89
4.3.4 Non-entry into force of the treaty as between the author of a reservation and the author of an objection with maximum effect .....	90
4.3.5 Effect of an objection on treaty relations.....	91
4.3.6 Effect of an objection on provisions other than those to which the reservation relates.....	97
4.3.7 Right of the author of a valid reservation not to be compelled to comply with the treaty without the benefit of its reservation .....	99
4.4 Effect of a reservation on rights and obligations outside of the treaty .....	100
4.4.1 Absence of effect on rights and obligations under another treaty.....	100
4.4.2 Absence of effect on rights and obligations under customary international law .....	101
4.4.3 Absence of effect on a peremptory norm of general international law ( <i>jus cogens</i> ) .....	102
4.5 Consequences of an invalid reservation.....	102
4.5.1 [3.3.2, later 4.5.1 and 4.5.2] Nullity of an invalid reservation .....	106
4.5.2 [4.5.3] Status of the author of an invalid reservation in relation to the treaty .....	112
4.5.3 [4.5.4] Reactions to an invalid reservation.....	121
4.6 Absence of effect of a reservation on the relations between the other parties to the treaty.....	124
4.7 Effect of an interpretative declaration.....	125
4.7.1 Clarification of the terms of the treaty by an interpretative declaration .....	126
4.7.2 Effect of the modification or the withdrawal of an interpretative declaration in respect of its author .....	131
4.7.3 Effect of an interpretative declaration approved by all the contracting States and contracting organizations... .....	132
5. Reservations, acceptances of and objections to reservations, and interpretative declarations in the case of succession of States.....	133
5.1 Reservations and succession of States .....	134
5.1.1 [5.1] Newly independent States.....	134
5.1.2 [5.2] Uniting or separation of States.....	139
5.1.3 [5.3] Irrelevance of certain reservations in cases involving a uniting of States .....	142
5.1.4 Establishment of new reservations formulated by a successor State.....	143
5.1.5 [5.4] Maintenance of the territorial scope of reservations formulated by the predecessor State .....	143
5.1.6 [5.5] Territorial scope of reservations in cases involving a uniting of States.....	144
5.1.7 [5.6] Territorial scope of reservations of the successor State in cases of succession involving part of a territory.... .....	146
5.1.8 [5.7] Timing of the effects of non-maintenance by a successor State of a reservation formulated by the predecessor State.....	146
5.1.9 [5.9] Late reservations formulated by a successor State .....	147
5.2 Objections to reservations and succession of States .....	148
5.2.1 [5.10] Maintenance by the successor State of objections formulated by the predecessor State.....	148
5.2.2 [5.11] Irrelevance of certain objections in cases involving a uniting of States .....	149
5.2.3 [5.12] Maintenance of objections to reservations of the predecessor State.....	150
5.2.4 [5.13] Reservations of the predecessor State to which no objections have been made.....	150
5.2.5 [5.14] Capacity of a successor State to formulate objections to reservations .....	151
5.2.6 [5.15] Objections by a successor State other than a newly independent State in respect of which a treaty continues in force.....	152
5.3 Acceptances of reservations and succession of States .....	153

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Page</i>
5.3.1 [5.16 bis] Maintenance by a newly independent State of express acceptances formulated by the predecessor State.....	153
5.3.2 [5.17] Maintenance by a successor State other than a newly independent State of express acceptances formulated by the predecessor State.....	154
5.3.3 [5.18] Timing of the effects of non-maintenance by a successor State of an express acceptance formulated by the predecessor State.....	155
5.4 Interpretative declarations and succession of States.....	155
5.4.1 [5.19] Interpretative declarations formulated by the predecessor State .....	155
<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Paragraphs</i>
V. EXPULSION OF ALIENS .....	107–183
A. Introduction .....	107–112
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session.....	113–183
1. Consideration of the revised and restructured draft articles on protection of the human rights of persons who have been or are being expelled.....	116–134
(a) Presentation of the draft articles by the Special Rapporteur .....	116–127
(b) Summary of the debate .....	128–134
2. Consideration of the sixth report of the Special Rapporteur .....	135–183
(a) Presentation by the Special Rapporteur.....	135–146
(b) Summary of the debate .....	147–172
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	173–183
VI. EFFECTS OF ARMED CONFLICTS ON TREATIES.....	184–289
A. Introduction .....	184–187
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session.....	188–289
1. General remarks on the topic.....	191–193
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	191
(b) Summary of the debate .....	192
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	193
2. Comments on the draft articles.....	194–289
Article 1. Scope .....	194–205
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	194–196
(b) Summary of the debate .....	197–201
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	202–205
Article 2. Use of terms.....	206–213
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	206–208
(b) Summary of the debate .....	209–212
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	213
Article 3. Absence of a rule under which, in the event of an armed conflict, treaties are <i>ipso facto</i> terminated or suspended.....	214–217
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	214
(b) Summary of the debate .....	215–216
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	217
Article 4. Indicia of susceptibility to termination, withdrawal or suspension of treaties .....	218–227
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	218–221
(b) Summary of the debate .....	222–226
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	227
Article 5 and annex. Operation of treaties on the basis of implication from their subject matter.....	228–238
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	228–232
(b) Summary of the debate .....	233–235
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	236–238
Article 6. Conclusion of treaties during armed conflict.....	239–243
Article 7. Express provisions on the operation of treaties .....	239–240
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	241–242
(b) Summary of the debate .....	243
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	244–254
Article 8. Notification of termination, withdrawal or suspension .....	244–247
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	248–250
(b) Summary of the debate .....	251–254
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks .....	174

	Paragraphs	Page
Article 9. Obligations imposed by international law independently of a treaty .....	175	
Article 10. Separability of treaty provisions.....	255–258	175
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	255–256	175
(b) Summary of the debate .....	257	175
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	258	175
Article 11. Loss of the right to terminate, withdraw from or suspend the operation of a treaty .....	175	
Article 12. Resumption of suspended treaties .....	259–264	175
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	259–261	175
(b) Summary of the debate .....	262–263	176
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	264	176
Article 13. Effect of the exercise of the right of individual or collective self-defence on a treaty .....	265–270	176
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	265–266	176
(b) Summary of the debate .....	267–268	176
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	269–270	177
Article 15. Prohibition of benefit to an aggressor State.....	271–276	177
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	271–272	177
(b) Summary of the debate .....	273–275	177
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	276	178
Article 14. Decisions of the Security Council .....	178	
Article 16. Rights and duties arising from the laws of neutrality.....	178	
Article 17. Other cases of termination, withdrawal or suspension.....	277–283	178
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	277–279	178
(b) Summary of the debate .....	280–282	179
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	283	179
3. Other issues.....	284–289	179
(a) Introduction by the Special Rapporteur.....	284–285	179
(b) Summary of the debate .....	286–288	179
(c) Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	289	179

*Chapter*

VII. PROTECTION OF PERSONS IN THE EVENT OF DISASTERS .....	290–331	180
A. Introduction .....	290–293	180
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session.....	294–329	180
1. Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of the third report .....	300–308	181
2. Summary of the debate .....	309–329	182
(a) Draft article 6. Humanitarian principles in disaster response .....	309–313	182
(b) Draft article 7. Human dignity .....	314–315	182
(c) Draft article 8. Primary responsibility of the affected State.....	316–324	183
3. Special Rapporteur’s concluding remarks.....	325–329	184
C. Text of the draft articles on protection of persons in the event of disasters provisionally adopted so far by the Commission .....	330–331	185
1. Text of the draft articles.....	330	185
2. Text of the draft articles and commentaries thereto provisionally adopted by the Commission at its sixty-second session .....	331	185
Article 1. Scope .....	185	
Article 2. Purpose .....	186	
Article 3. Definition of disaster .....	187	
Article 4. Relationship with international humanitarian law.....	188	
Article 5. Duty to cooperate.....	188	
VIII. THE OBLIGATION TO EXTRADITE OR PROSECUTE ( <i>aut dedere aut judicare</i> ).....	332–340	191
A. Introduction .....	332–334	191
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session.....	335–340	191
Discussions of the Working Group.....	337–340	191
IX. IMMUNITY OF STATE OFFICIALS FROM FOREIGN CRIMINAL JURISDICTION.....	341–343	193
A. Introduction .....	341–342	193
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session.....	343	193

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Paragraphs</i>	<i>Page</i>
X. TREATIES OVER TIME .....	344–354	194
A. Introduction .....	344	194
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session .....	345–354	194
1. Discussions of the Study Group .....	347–352	194
2. Future work and request for information .....	353–354	195
XI. THE MOST-FAVoured-NATION CLAUSE.....	355–373	196
A. Introduction .....	355–356	196
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session .....	357–373	196
1. Discussions of the Study Group .....	359–368	196
(a) Catalogue of most-favoured-nation provisions (Mr. Donald M. McRae and Mr. A. Rohan Perera) ....	360	196
(b) The 1978 draft articles of the International Law Commission (Mr. Shinya Murase).....	361	196
(c) Most-favoured nation in the GATT and the WTO (Mr. Donald M. McRae).....	362–363	197
(d) The work of OECD on most-favoured nation (Mr. Mahmoud Hmoud).....	364	197
(e) The work of UNCTAD on most-favoured nation (Mr. Stephen Vasciannie).....	365	198
(f) The <i>Maffezini</i> problem under investment treaties (Mr. A. Rohan Perera).....	366–368	198
2. Consideration of future work of the Study Group .....	369–373	199
XII. SHARED NATURAL RESOURCES .....	374–384	200
A. Introduction .....	374–375	200
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session .....	376–384	200
1. Discussions of the Working Group .....	378–383	200
2. Recommendation of the Working Group .....	384	201
XIII. OTHER DECISIONS AND CONCLUSIONS OF THE COMMISSION .....	385–426	202
A. Programme, procedures and working methods of the Commission and its documentation .....	385–404	202
1. Settlement of disputes clauses .....	388	202
2. Consideration of General Assembly resolution 64/116 of 16 December 2009 on the rule of law at the national and international levels .....	389–393	202
3. Working Group on the long-term Programme of Work .....	394	203
4. Methods of work of the Commission .....	395	203
5. Honoraria .....	396	203
6. Assistance to Special Rapporteurs .....	397	203
7. Attendance of Special Rapporteurs in the General Assembly during the consideration of the Commission's report .....	398	203
8. Documentation and publications .....	399–403	204
(a) Processing and issuance of reports of Special Rapporteurs .....	399	204
(b) Summary records of the work of the Commission .....	400	204
(c) Trust fund on the backlog relating to the <i>Yearbook of the International Law Commission</i> .....	401	204
(d) Assistance of the Codification Division .....	402	204
(e) Websites .....	403	204
9. Communication from the Chairperson of the African Union Commission on International Law .....	404	204
B. Date and place of the sixty-third session of the Commission .....	405	204
C. Cooperation with other bodies .....	406–410	204
D. Representation at the sixty-fifth session of the General Assembly .....	411–412	205
E. International Law Seminar .....	413–426	205