Chapter XII

OTHER DECISIONS AND CONCLUSIONS OF THE COMMISSION

A. Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction

266. At its 3132nd meeting, on 22 May 2012, the Commission decided to appoint Ms. Concepción Escobar Hernández as Special Rapporteur for the topic "Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction" to replace Mr. Roman Kolodkin.

B. Provisional application of treaties

267. At its 3132nd meeting, on 22 May 2012, the Commission also decided to include the topic "Provisional application of treaties" in its programme of work and decided to appoint Mr. Juan Manuel Gómez Robledo as Special Rapporteur for the topic.

C. Formation and evidence of customary international law

268. At its 3132nd meeting, on 22 May 2012, the Commission further decided to include the topic "Formation and evidence of customary international law" in its programme of work and decided to appoint Sir Michael Wood as Special Rapporteur for the topic.

D. Treaties over time

269. At its 3136th meeting, on 31 May 2012, the Commission decided (a) to change, with effect from its sixty-fifth session (2013), the format of the work on this topic as suggested by the Study Group and (b) to appoint Mr. Georg Nolte as Special Rapporteur for the topic "Subsequent agreements and subsequent practice in relation to the interpretation of treaties".

E. Programme, procedures and working methods of the Commission and its documentation

270. At its 3132nd meeting, on 22 May 2012, the Commission established a Planning Group for the current session.³⁷¹

271. The Planning Group held four meetings. It had before it section G of the topical summary of the

discussion held in the Sixth Committee of the General Assembly during its sixty-sixth session (A/CN.4/650 and Add.1), entitled "Other decisions and conclusions of the Commission"; General Assembly resolution 66/98 of 9 December 2011 on the report of the International Law Commission on the work of its sixty-third session, in particular paragraphs 22 to 28; and General Assembly resolution 66/102 of 9 December 2011 on the rule of law at the national and international levels.

1. Working Group on the long-term Programme of Work

272. At its first meeting, on 22 May 2012, the Planning Group decided to establish a Working Group on the long-term programme of work for the present quinquennium, chaired by Mr. Donald McRae. The Chairperson of the Working Group submitted an oral progress report to the Planning Group on 24 July 2012, noting, *inter alia*, that the Working Group had held four meetings during which it had considered some possible topics.

2. Work programme of the Commission for the remainder of the quinquennium

The Commission recalled its decision in 2011 that the Planning Group should cooperate with special rapporteurs and coordinators of study groups to define, at the beginning of any new topic, a tentative schedule for the development of the topic over a number of years, as may be required, and periodically review the attainment of annual targets in such schedule, updating it when appropriate.³⁷² The Commission further recalled that it was customary at the beginning of each quinquennium to prepare the Commission's work programme for the remainder of the quinquennium, setting out in general terms the anticipated goals in respect of each topic on the basis of indications by the special rapporteurs. It is the understanding of the Commission that the work programme has a tentative character since the nature and the complexities of the work preclude certainty in making predictions in advance.

Work programme (2013–2016)

(a) Expulsion of aliens

2013

Draft articles under consideration by States

2014

Commencement of second reading of the draft articles by the Commission

³⁷¹ The Planning Group was composed of Mr. Bernd Niehaus (Chairperson), Mr. Enrique Candioti, Mr. Pedro Comissário Afonso, Mr. Abdelrazeg El-Murtadi Suleiman Gouider, Ms. Concepción Escobar Hernández, Mr. Mathias Forteau, Mr. Hussein Hassouna, Mr. Mahmoud Hmoud, Ms. Marie Jacobsson, Mr. Maurice Kamto, Mr. Kriangsak Kittichaisaree, Mr. Ahmed Laraba, Mr. Donald McRae, Mr. Shinya Murase, Mr. Sean Murphy, Mr. Georg Nolte, Mr. Ki Gab Park, Mr. Ernest Petrič, Mr. Gilberto Vergne Saboia, Mr. Narinder Singh, Mr. Dire Tladi, Mr. Eduardo Valencia-Ospina, Mr. Amos Wako, Mr. Nugroho Wisnumurti, Sir Michael Wood and Mr. Pavel Šturma (*ex officio*).

³⁷² Yearbook ... 2011, vol. II (Part Two), para. 378 (c).

2015

Finalization and adoption of the draft articles on second reading by the Commission

2016

• •

(b) Protection of persons in the event of disasters

2013

Sixth report: the pre-disaster phase

2014

Seventh report: protection of relief personnel, use of terms, miscellaneous provisions, first reading, complete draft

2015

Comments of Governments on the draft adopted on first reading

2016

Eighth and final report: second reading, adoption of the complete set of articles

(c) Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction

2013

First substantive report to the Commission with draft articles; consideration and adoption of draft articles by the Drafting Committee

2014

Second report with draft articles; consideration and adoption of draft articles by the Drafting Committee

2015

Third report with draft articles; consideration and adoption of draft articles by the Drafting Committee

2016

Fourth report with draft articles; consideration and adoption of draft articles by the Drafting Committee; adoption of draft articles on first reading by the Commission

(d) Provisional application of treaties

2013

First report

2014

Second report with draft articles/guidelines/model clauses

2015

Third report with revised draft articles/guidelines/model clauses

2016

Fourth report

(e) Formation and evidence of customary international law

2013

First report: preliminary or background points/materials

2014

Second report: State practice and *opinio juris*, with draft conclusions or guidelines

2015

Third report: particular topics, such as the "persistent objector", with draft conclusions or guidelines

2016

Fourth report: revised consolidated set of conclusions or guidelines for discussion and adoption

(f) Subsequent agreements and subsequent practice in relation to the interpretation of treaties

2013

First report

2014

Second report

2015

Third report: provisional adoption of draft conclusions

2016

Finalization of draft conclusions

(g) The most-favoured-nation clause

2013

Presentation of a draft of a potential final report with additional research on specific topics

2014

Revision of draft report and adoption with amendment or request for further amendments and research

2015

Adoption of final report

2016

...

(h) The obligation to extradite or prosecute (aut dedere aut judicare)

The Commission will determine during its sixty-fifth session whether to continue with the topic, and, if so, how.

- 3. Consideration of General Assembly resolution 66/102 of 9 December 2011 on the rule of law at the national and international levels
- 274. The General Assembly, in resolution 66/102 of 9 December 2011 on the rule of law at the national and international levels, *inter alia*, reiterated its invitation to the Commission to comment, in its report to the General Assembly, on its current role in promoting the rule of law. The Commission has commented annually on its role in promoting the rule of law since 2008. It notes that the substance of the comprehensive comments contained in paragraphs 341 to 346 of its 2008 report³⁷³ remains relevant and reiterates the comments in paragraph 231 of its 2009 report,³⁷⁴ as well as the comments in paragraphs 390 to 393 of its 2010 report,³⁷⁵ and paragraphs 392 to 398 of its 2011 report.³⁷⁶
- 275. The Commission recalls that the rule of law constitutes the essence of the Commission, for its basic mission is to work for the progressive development and codification of international law, bearing in mind its implementation at the national level. The Commission notes that the role of the General Assembly in encouraging the progressive development of international law and its codification is reaffirmed in General Assembly resolution 66/102 on the rule of law at the national and international levels.
- 276. The Commission recalls that, as an organ established by the General Assembly and in keeping with the mandate set out in Article 13, paragraph (1) (a), of the Charter of the United Nations, and in its statute, it continues to promote the progressive development and codification of international law through its work. The work of the Commission has led to the adoption by States of a significant number of conventions. For such conventions to serve their full purpose, they need to be ratified and implemented. In addition to formulating draft articles, the Commission's output takes other forms, which also contribute to the progressive development and codification of international law. Having in mind the principle of the rule of law in all its work, the Commission is fully conscious of the importance of the implementation of international law at the national level. The Commission considers that its work to promote the progressive development and

codification of international law demonstrates the manner in which the Commission aims at promoting the rule of law at the international level.

- 277. The Commission welcomes the decision of the General Assembly to declare "The rule of law at the national and international levels" as the thematic subject for the present year and to hold the 2012 high-level meeting.
- 278. Bearing in mind the close interrelation of the rule of law at the national and international levels, the Commission, in fulfilling its mandate of codification and progressive development, considers that its work should take into account, where appropriate, the principles of human rights that are fundamental to the international rule of law as reflected in the preamble and in Article 13 of the Charter of the United Nations. Accordingly, the Commission has promoted awareness of the rule of law at the national and international levels through its work on such topics as expulsion of aliens, protection of persons in the event of disasters and immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction.
- 279. The Commission reiterates its commitment to the rule of law in all of its activities.

4. Honoraria

280. The Commission reiterates once more its views concerning the question of honoraria, resulting from the adoption by the General Assembly of its resolution 56/272 of 27 March 2002, which has been expressed in the previous reports of the Commission.³⁷⁷ The Commission emphasizes that the above resolution especially affects special rapporteurs, as it compromises support for their research work.

5. DOCUMENTATION AND PUBLICATIONS

281. The Commission reiterated its recognition of the particular relevance and significant value of the legal publications prepared by the Secretariat to its work.³⁷⁸ In particular, the Commission welcomed the publication of the eighth edition of The Work of the International Law Commission, a publication which provides a comprehensive, authoritative and up-to-date review of the Commission's contribution to the progressive development and codification of international law. The Commission noted, with appreciation, the Codification Division's intention to continue the practice of issuing new editions of the publication at the beginning of each quinquennium. In addition, the Secretariat was requested to make every effort to issue that publication in the other five official languages as soon as possible. The Commission also welcomed the publication of the 2010 volume of the United Nations Juridical Yearbook, as well as of a new edition of

³⁷³ Yearbook ... 2008, vol. II (Part Two), pp. 163–164.

³⁷⁴ Yearbook ... 2009, vol. II (Part Two), p. 162.

³⁷⁵ Yearbook ... 2010, vol. II (Part Two), pp. 202–203.

³⁷⁶ Yearbook ... 2011, vol. II (Part Two), p. 178.

³⁷⁷ See *Yearbook* ... 2002, vol. II (Part Two), paras. 525–531; *Yearbook* ... 2003, vol. II (Part Two), para. 447; *Yearbook* ... 2004, vol. II (Part Two), para. 369; *Yearbook* ... 2005, vol. II (Part Two), para. 501; *Yearbook* ... 2006, vol. II (Part Two), para. 269; *Yearbook* ... 2007, vol. II (Part Two), para. 379; *Yearbook* ... 2008, vol. II (Part Two), para. 358; *Yearbook* ... 2009, vol. II (Part Two), para. 240; *Yearbook* ... 2010, vol. II (Part Two), para. 396; and *Yearbook* ... 2011, vol. II (Part Two), para. 399.

³⁷⁸ See *Yearbook* ... 2007, vol. II (Part Two), paras. 387–395.

the *United Nations Legislative Series*, entitled *Materials on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts*.³⁷⁹ The Commission underlines the usefulness of the continuation of the publication of the *Legislative Series*. The Commission requested that the Secretariat continue to provide the Commission with such publications in hard-copy format.

- 282. The Commission further noted with appreciation that the Codification Division was able to expedite significantly the issuance of those publications through the continuation and expansion of its desktop publishing initiative, which greatly enhanced the timeliness and relevance of those publications to the Commission's work.
- 283. The Commission recommends that, in its documents and publications, and particularly in the legal instruments it has adopted, including the versions appearing in the *Official Records of the General Assembly*, the United Nations editors adopt the style of commencing the first word of a subsidiary part of a sentence set as a subparagraph in lower case, where the text is run on from the sentence.
- 284. The Commission welcomes the progress in the elimination of the backlog in the publication of the *Yearbook of the International Law Commission*. It commends the Publications, Editing and Proofreading Section for its efforts and encourages it to continue its valuable work in the preparation of this important publication.
- 285. The Commission expresses its gratitude to all services involved in the processing of documents, both in Geneva and in New York, for their timely and efficient processing of the Commission's documents, often under narrow time constraints, which contributes to the smooth conduct of the Commission's work.
- 286. The Commission wishes to express its appreciation to the United Nations Office at Geneva Library, which assists its members very efficiently and competently.
 - 6. Trust fund on the backlog relating to the Yearbook of the International Law Commission
- 287. The Commission reiterated that the *Yearbook* was critical to the understanding of the Commission's work in the progressive development of international law and its codification, as well as in the strengthening of the rule of law in international relations. The Commission noted that the General Assembly, in its resolution 66/98, had expressed its appreciation to Governments that had made voluntary contributions to the trust fund on the backlog relating to the *Yearbook of the International Law Commission* and had encouraged further contributions to the fund.

7. Assistance of the Codification Division

288. The Commission expressed its appreciation for the valuable assistance of the Codification Division of the Secretariat in its substantive servicing of the Commission and its involvement in research projects on the work of the Commission. The Commission reiterated the particular relevance and significant value of the legal publications prepared by the Codification Division to its work and

379 ST/LEG/SER.B/25.

reiterated its request that the Codification Division continue to provide the Commission with those publications.

8. Websites

289. The Commission once again expressed its appreciation for the results of the activity of the Secretariat in its continuous updating and management of its website on the International Law Commission. The Commission reiterated that this website and other websites maintained by the Codification Division constitute an invaluable resource for the Commission and for researchers on the work of the Commission in the wider community, thereby contributing to the overall strengthening of the teaching, study, dissemination and wider appreciation of international law as recalled in paragraph 412 of the Commission's 2011 report. The Commission welcomed the fact that the website on the work of the Commission includes information on the current status of the topics on the agenda of the Commission, as well as advance edited versions of summary records of the Commission.

F. Date and place of the sixty-fifth session of the Commission

290. The Commission decided that the sixty-fifth session of the Commission would be held in Geneva from 6 May to 7 June and from 8 July to 9 August 2013.

G. Cooperation with other bodies

- 291. At its 3148th meeting, on 24 July 2012, Judge Peter Tomka, President of the International Court of Justice, addressed the Commission and informed it of the Court's recent activities and of the cases currently before it,³⁸³ drawing special attention to aspects of particular relevance to the work of the Commission. An exchange of views followed.
- 292. The European Committee on Legal Co-operation and the Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law of the Council of Europe were represented at the present session of the Commission by the Chair of the Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law, Ms. Edwige Belliard, and the Director of Legal Advice and Public International Law of the Council of Europe, Mr. Manuel Lezertua, who addressed the Commission at its 3140th meeting, on 4 July 2012. 384 They focused on the current activities of the Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law on a variety of legal matters, as well as on those of the Council of Europe. An exchange of views followed.
- 293. The African Union Commission on International Law was represented at the present session of the Commission by Mr. Blaise Tchikaya and Mr. Minelik Alemu Getahun, who addressed the Commission at its 3146th meeting, on 17 July 2012.³⁸⁵ They gave an overview

³⁸⁰ http://legal.un.org/ilc.

³⁸¹ Generally accessible from http://legal.un.org/cod.

³⁸² Yearbook ... 2011, vol. II (Part Two), p. 180.

³⁸³ This statement is recorded in the summary record of that meeting.

³⁸⁴ *Idem*.

³⁸⁵ *Idem*.

of the activities of the African Union Commission on International Law. An exchange of views followed.

294. The Inter-American Juridical Committee was represented at the present session of the Commission by Mr. David P. Stewart, who addressed the Commission at its 3149th meeting, on 25 July 2012.³⁸⁶ He gave an overview of the activities of the Committee as contained in its annual report. An exchange of views followed.

295. The Secretary-General of the Asian–African Legal Consultative Organization, Mr. Rahmat Mohamad, addressed the Commission at its 3150th meeting, on 26 July 2012.³⁸⁷ He briefed the Commission on the recent and forthcoming activities of his organization. In particular, he reviewed the consideration given by his organization to the work of the Commission. An exchange of views followed.

296. On 10 July 2012, an informal exchange of views was held between members of the Commission and ICRC on topics of mutual interest, including an overview of the main priorities of the ICRC Legal Division and a presentation on the ICRC project on strengthening legal protection for victims of armed conflicts, as well as issues concerning "Protection of the environment in relation to armed conflicts". 388 An exchange of views followed.

H. Representation at the sixty-seventh session of the General Assembly

297. The Commission decided that it should be represented at the sixty-seventh session of the General Assembly by its Chairperson, Mr. Lucius Caflisch.

298. At its 3158th meeting, on 3 August 2012, the Commission requested Mr. Maurice Kamto, Special Rapporteur on the topic "Expulsion of aliens", to attend the sixty-seventh session of the General Assembly under the terms of paragraph 5 of General Assembly resolution 44/35 of 4 December 1989.

299. The Commission wishes that the former Special Rapporteur on the topic "Reservations to treaties", Mr. Alain Pellet, be invited by the Sixth Committee of the General Assembly in order to attend the debate in the Sixth Committee on the chapter of the 2011 report of the Commission that relates to this topic.³⁸⁹

I. Tribute to the Secretary of the Commission

300. At its 3158th meeting, on 3 August 2012, the Commission paid tribute to Mr. Václav Mikulka, who has

acted with high distinction as Secretary of the Commission since 1999, and who will retire after the present session; expressed its gratitude for the outstanding contribution made by him to the work of the Commission and to the codification and progressive development of international law; acknowledged with appreciation his professionalism, dedication to public service and commitment to international law; and extended its very best wishes to him in his future endeavours.

J. International Law Seminar

301. Pursuant to General Assembly resolution 66/98, the forty-eighth session of the International Law Seminar was held at the Palais des Nations from 2 to 20 July 2012, during the present session of the Commission. The Seminar is intended for advanced students specializing in international law and for young professors or government officials pursuing an academic or diplomatic career or in posts in the civil service of their country.

302. Twenty-four participants of different nationalities, from all the regions of the world, took part in the session.³⁹⁰ The participants attended plenary meetings of the Commission and specially arranged lectures and participated in working groups on specific topics.

303. The Seminar was opened by Mr. Lucius Caflisch, Chairperson of the Commission. Mr. Markus Schmidt, Senior Legal Adviser of the United Nations Office at Geneva, was responsible for the administration, organization and conduct of the Seminar. The scientific coordination of the Seminar was ensured by the University of Geneva. Mr. Vittorio Mainetti, from the University of Geneva, acted as coordinator, assisted by Mr. Martin Denis, legal assistant.

304. The following lectures were given by members of the Commission: Mr. Ernest Petrič, "The work of the International Law Commission"; Ms. Concepción Escobar Hernández, "Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction"; Mr. Georg Nolte, "Treaties over time"; Mr. Donald McRae, "The most-favourednation clause"; Mr. Shinya Murase, "The protection of atmosphere in international law: rationale for codification"; and Mr. Maurice Kamto, "Expulsion of aliens".

305. Lectures were also given by Mr. Eric Tistounet, Chief of the Human Rights Council Branch of the Office

³⁸⁶ *Idem*.

³⁸⁷ Idem.

³⁸⁸ Ms. Jelena Pejic, Legal Adviser of ICRC, gave an overview of the joint ICRC/Swiss initiative on strengthening international humanitarian law compliance mechanisms and Mr. Ramin Mahnad gave a presentation on the ICRC project on strengthening legal protection for persons deprived of their liberty in non-international armed conflicts. Ms. Marie Jacobsson gave an overview of the topic "Protection of the environment in relation to armed conflicts", which is in the long-term programme of work of the Commission.

³⁸⁹ See *Yearbook ... 2011*, vol. II (Part Two), chap. IV, and *ibid.*, vol. II (Part Three).

³⁹⁰ The following persons participated in the forty-eighth session of the International Law Seminar: Ms. Adejumoke Adegbonmire (Nigeria), Ms. Mariam Al-Hail (Qatar), Ms. Alma Amézquita Manzano (Mexico), Mr. Michel-Ange Bontemps (Haiti), Mr. Sékou Camara (Guinea), Ms. Xiaohua Chen (China), Ms. Rhia Rilina Chowdhury (India), Ms. Carolina Claro (Brazil), Ms. Yolande Dwarika (South Africa), Ms. Desislava Gosteva (Bulgaria), Ms. Eugenia Gutiérrez-Ruiz (Costa Rica), Ms. Sara Ianovitz (Italy), Mr. Levon Isakhanyan (Georgia), Ms. Yuriko Kuga (Japan), Mr. Thushara Kumarage (Sri Lanka), Mr. Marco Mollar (Argentina), Mr. Josel Mostajo (Philippines), Ms. Michaela Rišova (Slovakia), Mr. Abderrezak Seghiri (Algeria), Mr. Regis Simo (Cameroon), Ms. Kate Smyth (Australia), Ms. Lucia Solano Ramirez (Colombia), Ms. Alexia Solomou (Cyprus), and Mr. Tesfagabir Teweldebirhan Kibrom (Eritrea). The Selection Committee, chaired by Ms. Laurence Boisson de Chazournes, Professor of International Law and International Organizations at the University of Geneva, met on 26 April 2012 at the Palais des Nations and selected 25 candidates out of 94 applications for participation in the Seminar. At the last minute, one selected candidate could not attend.

of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, on "The revision of the mechanisms of the Human Rights Council: an assessment"; and by Ms. Jelena Pejic, Legal Adviser in the Legal Division of ICRC, on "Current challenges to international humanitarian law".

- 306. Two special external sessions were organized at the University of Geneva and at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies in Geneva. At the University of Geneva, participants of the Seminar attended a brainstorming session on the topic "The environment in relation to armed conflict". The session was followed by a reception offered by the University of Geneva. At the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, participants of the Seminar attended a session on "The protection of atmosphere in international law".
- 307. Seminar participants had the opportunity to familiarize themselves with the work of other international organizations based in Geneva. The participants also attended a session of the Human Rights Committee and a side event organized at the World Intellectual Property Organization on the topic "Intellectual property and safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage: understanding the international legal landscape". Finally, a visit of the European Organization for Nuclear Research was organized.
- 308. Three seminar working groups, on "Crimes against humanity as a possible topic for codification", "Protection of persons in the event of disasters" and "Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction", were organized. Each seminar participant was assigned to one of the groups. Three members of the Commission, Ms. Concepción Escobar Hernandez, Mr. Sean Murphy and Mr. Eduardo Valencia-Ospina, supervised and provided expert guidance to the working groups. Each group prepared a report and presented its findings to the Seminar in a special session. The reports were compiled and distributed to all participants as well as to the members of the Commission.
- 309. The Republic and Canton of Geneva offered its traditional hospitality to the participants with a guided tour

- of the Hôtel de Ville and the Alabama Room, followed by a reception.
- 310. Mr. Lucius Caflisch, Chairperson of the International Law Commission, Mr. Markus Schmidt, Director of the Seminar, and Ms. Mariam Al-Hail (Qatar), on behalf of the participants of the Seminar, addressed the Commission and the participants during the closing ceremony of the Seminar. Each participant was presented with a certificate attesting to his or her participation in the forty-eighth session of the Seminar.
- 311. The Commission noted with particular appreciation that, since 2010, the Governments of Austria, China, Finland, India, Ireland, Sweden and Switzerland had made voluntary contributions to the United Nations Trust Fund for the International Law Seminar. The financial situation of the Fund allowed for the awarding of a sufficient number of fellowships to deserving candidates, especially from developing countries, in order to achieve adequate geographical distribution of participants. This year, fellowships (travel and subsistence allowance) were awarded to 15 candidates.
- 312. Since 1965, the year of the Seminar's inception, 1,093 participants, representing 170 nationalities, have taken part in the Seminar. Of them, 669 have received a fellowship.
- 313. The Commission stresses the importance it attaches to the Seminar, which enables young lawyers, especially from developing countries, to familiarize themselves with the work of the Commission and the activities of the many international organizations that have their headquarters in Geneva. The Commission recommends that the General Assembly again appeal to States to make voluntary contributions in order to secure the holding of the Seminar in 2013 with as broad participation as possible.
- 314. The Commission noted with satisfaction that, in 2012, comprehensive interpretation services were made available to the Seminar. It expresses the hope that the same services will be provided at the next session of 2013, within existing resources.