

DOCUMENT A/67/10*

Report of the International Law Commission on the work of its sixty-fourth session (7 May–1 June and 2 July–3 August 2012)

CONTENTS

| | <i>Page</i> |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Abbreviations..... | 5 |
| Note concerning quotations | 5 |
| Multilateral instruments cited in the present volume..... | 6 |
| <i>Chapter</i> | |
| | <i>Paragraphs</i> |
| I. ORGANIZATION OF THE SESSION | 1–12 9 |
| A. Membership..... | 2 9 |
| B. Officers and the Enlarged Bureau..... | 3–5 9 |
| C. Drafting Committee..... | 6–7 10 |
| D. Working groups and study groups..... | 8–10 10 |
| E. Secretariat | 11 10 |
| F. Agenda..... | 12 10 |
| II. SUMMARY OF THE WORK OF THE COMMISSION AT ITS SIXTY-FOURTH SESSION | 13–27 11 |
| III. SPECIFIC ISSUES ON WHICH COMMENTS WOULD BE OF PARTICULAR INTEREST TO THE COMMISSION | 28–29 13 |
| A. Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction | 28 13 |
| B. Formation and evidence of customary international law..... | 29 13 |
| IV. EXPULSION OF ALIENS | 30–46 14 |
| A. Introduction | 30–37 14 |
| B. Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 38–44 15 |
| C. Text of the draft articles on the expulsion of aliens adopted by the Commission on first reading..... | 45–46 15 |
| 1. Text of the draft articles | 45 15 |
| 2. Text of the draft articles with commentaries thereto | 46 18 |
| PART ONE GENERAL PROVISIONS | 18 |
| Article 1. Scope..... | 18 |
| Article 2. Use of terms | 19 |
| Article 3. Right of expulsion..... | 20 |
| Article 4. Requirement for conformity with law..... | 21 |
| Article 5. Grounds for expulsion..... | 22 |
| PART TWO CASES OF PROHIBITED EXPULSION | 23 |
| Article 6. Prohibition of the expulsion of refugees..... | 23 |
| Article 7. Prohibition of the expulsion of stateless persons..... | 25 |
| Article 8. Other rules specific to the expulsion of refugees and stateless persons..... | 25 |
| Article 9. Deprivation of nationality for the sole purpose of expulsion | 25 |
| Article 10. Prohibition of collective expulsion | 26 |
| Article 11. Prohibition of disguised expulsion..... | 27 |
| Article 12. Prohibition of expulsion for purposes of confiscation of assets | 29 |
| Article 13. Prohibition of the resort to expulsion in order to circumvent an extradition procedure..... | 29 |
| PART THREE PROTECTION OF THE RIGHTS OF ALIENS SUBJECT TO EXPULSION | 30 |
| CHAPTER I GENERAL PROVISIONS | 30 |
| Article 14. Obligation to respect the human dignity and human rights of aliens subject to expulsion | 30 |

* Initially distributed as *Official Records of the General Assembly, Sixty-seventh Session, Supplement No. 10.*

| <i>Chapter</i> | | <i>Page</i> | |
|----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|----|
| Article 15. | Obligation not to discriminate | 31 | |
| Article 16. | Vulnerable persons | 32 | |
| CHAPTER II | PROTECTION REQUIRED IN THE EXPELLING STATE..... | 33 | |
| Article 17. | Obligation to protect the right to life of an alien subject to expulsion | 33 | |
| Article 18. | Prohibition of torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment..... | 33 | |
| Article 19. | Detention conditions of an alien subject to expulsion | 33 | |
| Article 20. | Obligation to respect the right to family life..... | 35 | |
| CHAPTER III | PROTECTION IN RELATION TO THE STATE OF DESTINATION..... | 36 | |
| Article 21. | Departure to the State of destination | 36 | |
| Article 22. | State of destination of aliens subject to expulsion | 37 | |
| Article 23. | Obligation not to expel an alien to a State where his or her life or freedom would be threatened..... | 39 | |
| Article 24. | Obligation not to expel an alien to a State where he or she may be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment | 39 | |
| CHAPTER IV | PROTECTION IN THE TRANSIT STATE | 41 | |
| Article 25. | Protection in the transit State of the human rights of an alien subject to expulsion | 41 | |
| PART FOUR | SPECIFIC PROCEDURAL RULES | 41 | |
| Article 26. | Procedural rights of aliens subject to expulsion | 41 | |
| Article 27. | Suspensive effect of an appeal against an expulsion decision | 46 | |
| Article 28. | Procedures for individual recourse | 47 | |
| PART FIVE | LEGAL CONSEQUENCES OF EXPULSION..... | 47 | |
| Article 29. | Readmission to the expelling State | 47 | |
| Article 30. | Protection of the property of an alien subject to expulsion | 48 | |
| Article 31. | Responsibility of States in cases of unlawful expulsion | 50 | |
| Article 32. | Diplomatic protection | 52 | |
| | | <i>Paragraphs</i> | |
| V. | PROTECTION OF PERSONS IN THE EVENT OF DISASTERS | 47–81 | 54 |
| A. | Introduction | 47–52 | 54 |
| B. | Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 53–80 | 54 |
| 1. | Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of the fifth report | 57–61 | 55 |
| 2. | Summary of the debate | 62–74 | 56 |
| (a) | General remarks | 62–65 | 56 |
| (b) | Comments on draft article A | 66–69 | 56 |
| (c) | Comments on draft article 13 | 70–72 | 57 |
| (d) | Comments on draft article 14 | 73–74 | 57 |
| 3. | Concluding remarks of the Special Rapporteur | 75–80 | 57 |
| C. | Text of the draft articles on the protection of persons in the event of disasters provisionally adopted so far by the Commission | 81 | 58 |
| VI. | IMMUNITY OF STATE OFFICIALS FROM FOREIGN CRIMINAL JURISDICTION | 82–139 | 59 |
| A. | Introduction | 82–83 | 59 |
| B. | Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 84–139 | 59 |
| 1. | Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of the preliminary report | 86–88 | 59 |
| 2. | Summary of the debate | 89–136 | 60 |
| (a) | General remarks | 89–91 | 60 |
| (b) | Methodological considerations | 92–104 | 60 |
| (i) | Progressive development of international law and its codification | 92–97 | 60 |
| (ii) | Systemic approach | 98–99 | 61 |
| (iii) | Trends in international law | 100 | 61 |
| (iv) | Values of the international community | 101–103 | 61 |
| (v) | Identification of basic questions | 104 | 61 |
| (c) | Substantive considerations | 105–133 | 61 |
| (i) | Scope of the topic | 108–111 | 62 |
| (ii) | Use of certain terms | 112–113 | 62 |
| (iii) | Immunity <i>ratione personae</i> | 114–118 | 63 |
| (iv) | Immunity <i>ratione materiae</i> | 119–125 | 63 |
| (v) | Possible exceptions to immunity | 126–133 | 64 |
| (d) | Procedural aspects | 134–135 | 65 |
| (e) | Final form | 136 | 65 |

| <i>Chapter</i> | <i>Paragraphs</i> | <i>Page</i> |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 3. Concluding remarks of the Special Rapporteur..... | 137–139 | 65 |
| VII. PROVISIONAL APPLICATION OF TREATIES | 140–155 | 67 |
| A. Introduction | 140 | 67 |
| B. Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 141–155 | 67 |
| Report of the Special Rapporteur of the informal consultations held on the topic | 144–155 | 67 |
| VIII. FORMATION AND EVIDENCE OF CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW..... | 156–202 | 69 |
| A. Introduction | 156 | 69 |
| B. Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 157–202 | 69 |
| 1. Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of his note..... | 160–168 | 69 |
| 2. Summary of the debate | 169–191 | 70 |
| (a) General comments | 169–172 | 70 |
| (b) Scope of the topic and use of terms | 173–177 | 70 |
| (c) Methodology | 178–183 | 70 |
| (d) Points to be covered | 184–190 | 71 |
| (e) Final outcome of the Commission’s work on the topic..... | 191 | 72 |
| 3. Concluding remarks of the Special Rapporteur..... | 192–202 | 72 |
| IX. THE OBLIGATION TO EXTRADITE OR PROSECUTE (<i>AUT DEDERE AUT JUDICARE</i>) | 203–221 | 74 |
| A. Introduction | 203–205 | 74 |
| B. Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 206–221 | 74 |
| Discussions of the Working Group..... | 208–221 | 74 |
| (a) Major issues facing the topic | 210–213 | 74 |
| (b) Relationship with universal jurisdiction..... | 214 | 75 |
| (c) Feasibility of the topic | 215–219 | 75 |
| (d) Judgment of the International Court of Justice in the <i>Questions relating to the Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite (Belgium v. Senegal)</i> case..... | 220 | 76 |
| (e) Way forward | 221 | 76 |
| X. TREATIES OVER TIME | 222–240 | 77 |
| A. Introduction | 222–224 | 77 |
| B. Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 225–240 | 77 |
| 1. Discussions of the Study Group | 229–239 | 77 |
| (a) Completion of the consideration of the second report by the Chairperson of the Study Group | 230–231 | 77 |
| (b) Consideration of the third report by the Chairperson of the Study Group | 232–234 | 78 |
| (c) Modalities of the Commission’s work on the topic | 235–239 | 78 |
| 2. Preliminary conclusions by the Chairperson of the Study Group, reformulated in the light of the discussions in the Study Group | 240 | 79 |
| (1) Subsequent practice as reflecting a position regarding the interpretation of a treaty | 79 | |
| (2) Specificity of subsequent practice | 79 | |
| (3) The degree of active participation in a practice and silence | 79 | |
| (4) Effects of contradictory subsequent practice | 79 | |
| (5) Subsequent agreement or practice and formal amendment or interpretation procedures | 80 | |
| (6) Subsequent practice and possible modification of a treaty | 80 | |
| XI. THE MOST-FAVoured-NATION CLAUSE..... | 241–265 | 81 |
| A. Introduction | 241–242 | 81 |
| B. Consideration of the topic at the present session..... | 243–265 | 81 |
| 1. Work of the Study Group..... | 245–249 | 81 |
| 2. Discussions of the Study Group at the present session | 250–265 | 82 |
| (a) Effect of the mixed nature of investment tribunals on the application of MFN clauses to procedural provisions (Mr. Mathias Forteau) | 255–257 | 82 |
| (b) Interpretation of MFN clauses by investment tribunals (Mr. Donald McRae)..... | 258–259 | 83 |
| (c) Summary of the discussions | 260–265 | 83 |
| XII. OTHER DECISIONS AND CONCLUSIONS OF THE COMMISSION | 266–314 | 85 |
| A. Immunity of State officials from foreign criminal jurisdiction | 266 | 85 |
| B. Provisional application of treaties | 267 | 85 |
| C. Formation and evidence of customary international law..... | 268 | 85 |
| D. Treaties over time | 269 | 85 |
| E. Programme, procedures and working methods of the Commission and its documentation..... | 270–289 | 85 |
| 1. Working Group on the long-term programme of work | 272 | 85 |

| | <i>Paragraphs</i> | <i>Page</i> |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 2. Work programme of the Commission for the remainder of the quinquennium | 273 | 85 |
| 3. Consideration of General Assembly resolution 66/102 of 9 December 2011 on the rule of law at the national and international levels..... | 274–279 | 87 |
| 4. Honoraria..... | 280 | 87 |
| 5. Documentation and publications | 281–286 | 87 |
| 6. Trust fund on the backlog relating to the <i>Yearbook of the International Law Commission</i> | 287 | 88 |
| 7. Assistance of the Codification Division | 288 | 88 |
| 8. Websites..... | 289 | 88 |
| F. Date and place of the sixty-fifth session of the Commission | 290 | 88 |
| G. Cooperation with other bodies..... | 291–296 | 88 |
| H. Representation at the sixty-seventh session of the General Assembly | 297–299 | 89 |
| I. Tribute to the Secretary of the Commission..... | 300 | 89 |
| J. International Law Seminar | 301–314 | 89 |