

REPORTS OF INTERNATIONAL ARBITRAL AWARDS

RECUEIL DES SENTENCES ARBITRALES

Index

VOLUME XXI



NATIONS UNIES - UNITED NATIONS
Copyright (c) 2006

INDEX

- Agreement of 27 March 1972 on mutual fishing relations between France and Canada 270, 276-277, 281, 321-322
Article 1 294 (text)
Article 2 276
Article 3 276-277, 294 (text)
Article 4 276-277 (text)
Article 8 290
Coastal fishing 276-277
Coordinates listed 299
Fishing in the Gulf of St. Lawrence 276
Fishing quotas 276
Line limiting the territorial waters of Canada and the areas under French fishery jurisdiction 277
“On an equal footing” 277
Projection of coasts 306
Reciprocity 294-295
Trawler fishing 276-277
- Agreement of 30 March 1989 fixing the quotas for French fishermen in Canadian waters for the period 1989-1991 278
Article 2 282
- Agreement of 30 March 1989 establishing a court of arbitration for the purpose of carrying out the delimitation of maritime areas between France and Canada (“1989 Agreement”) 270-273
Article 1 271 (text)
Article 2 271 (text), 277, 282
Article 3 271-272 (text)
Article 4 272 (text), 274
Article 5 272 (text), 274
Article 6 272 (text)
Article 7 272-273 (text)
Article 8 273 (text)
Article 9 273 (text)
Article 10 273 (text)
Article 11 273 (text)
- Arbitration
Award between Argentina and Chile (see “Arbitration award”)
Compromise between France and Canada 270-273, 278, 282
- Arbitration award between Argentina and Chile concerning the Beagle Channel (1977) (see also “Case concerning a dispute between Argentina and Chile”)

- Admiralty memorandum 132-134, 197-211
Agreement to arbitrate, text of 64-71
Annexes 193-225
 Argentine reply concerning British memorandum 211-214
 Boundary line, tracing of 216-217
 British inter-departmental exchanges 197-211
 Chilean notes 193-197
 Queen Elizabeth II, declaration of 224-225
 Sea traffic in Beagle Channel region 214-215
 Speeches of president of court 217-223
Argentine reply concerning British memorandum 211-214
British inter-departmental exchanges 132-134, 197-211
Boundary line, tracing of 216-217
Boundary treaty of 1881, interpretation of (see "Boundary Treaty")
Chilean notes 193-197
Compromiso 64-71
Confirmatory or corroborative post-treaty material (see "Boundary Treaty")
Decision 77-193
Declaration of invalidity of award 226-236
Declaration of Judge Gros 190-193
Declaration of Queen Elizabeth II 224-225
Deliberations of court 76-77
Dispositif 189-193
Exchange of diplomatic notes concerning award 226-236
Geography of dispute 77-81
Historical considerations 81-83
Invalidity of award, declaration of 226-236
Judge Gros, declaration of 190-193
Nullity of award, declaration of 226-236
Parties 61-62
Personnel 61-62
Queen Elizabeth II, declaration of 224-225
Report 61-76
Scope of dispute 77-81
Sea traffic in Beagle Channel region 214-215
Speeches of president of court 217-223
Steps preceding arbitration 63
Submissions of parties, formal 73-76
Summary of proceedings 71-73
Table of contents 57-60
Task of the court 77-81
Treaty of 1881, interpretation of (see "Boundary Treaty")
Argentina
 Beagle Channel dispute with Chile (case) 55-264
Atlantic principle 90-91, 112-115, 118-119, 120-121
Beagle Channel
 Arbitration award (see "Arbitration award")

- Boundary Treaty of 1881 (see “Boundary Treaty”)
Dispute between Argentina and Chile (case) 55-264
Geography of
 Channel arms 129-130
 Generally 78-79
Islands within (Boundary Treaty of 1881) 143-146
Navigation 261-264
Sea traffic in region 214-215
“Treaty” arm of (Boundary Treaty of 1881)
 Conclusion 141
 Geography of channel arms 129-130
 Generally 131-136
 Northern arm as 136-141
- Bengal
Boundary Commission, report of (Radcliff Award) 4-9
Boundary dispute between India and Pakistan (case) 3-51
East and West 3, 11-12
- Boundary
Bengal Boundary Commission, report of 4-9
Dispute between Argentina and Chile (case) 55-264
Dispute between India and Pakistan (case) 3-51
Indo-Pakistan Boundary Disputes Tribunal 10-11
Territorial sea 277
Treaty between Argentina and Chile
 Boundary Treaty of 1881 (see “Boundary Treaty”)
 Treaty of peace and friendship (1984) (see “Treaty of Peace”)
Boundary Treaty of 1881 between Argentina and Chile, court interpretation of 84-147, 147-189 (see also “Arbitration award”)
Argentine attribution under the “Islands clause”
 Conclusion 127
 Contention of parties 106-116
 Court’s view 116-122, 127
 Preliminary questions 105-106
 Protocol of 1893 124-127
 Valderrama proposal 122-124
Atlantic principle 90-91, 112-115, 118-119, 120-121
Bases of negotiations (1876) 92-93
Beagle Channel (see also “Beagle Channel”)
 Geography of 129-130
 Islands within 143-146
 “Treaty” arm of 131-141
Cape Horn 112, 115-116
Cartography (post-treaty)
 1881-1888 period 170-171
 Admiralty chart/map 153-157
 Argentine attitude about 164-167, 175-181
 Argentine policy changes and decrees 175-181
 Authoritative map 160-163

- Conclusion 182-183
- “Delachaux” map 181
- Evaluation, principles of 167-168
- Generally 163, 168-169
- “Hoskold” maps 179-181
- Hydrographic notice with map 160-163
- “Irigoyen” map 142, 157-158
- “Latzina” maps 158-159, 176-178
- “Moreno” maps 179
- Non-official 164-166, 175-181
- Official and semi-official 164-165, 166-167, 175-181
- Parties’ own maps 167
- “Paz Soldan” maps 171-172
- “Pelliza” map 173-175
- Post 1881-1888 period 172-173
- Relevance of map evidence 163-164
- Temporal (chronological) factors 167-168, 170-182
- Third-country maps 167, 181-182
- Chilean attribution under the “Islands clause”
 - Beagle Channel (see this heading)
 - Conclusion 141, 146-147
 - Islands within the Beagle Channel 143-146
 - Preliminary points 127-129
 - “Treaty” arm of Beagle Channel 131-141
 - Unresolved questions 146-147
 - Western islands 141-143
- Coasts 117
- Compromise, treaty as 88, 94-95
- Confirmatory or corroborative post-treaty material 147-189
 - “Apuntes” (notes and comments) 153
 - Argentine acts 147-160
 - Cartography (see this heading)
 - Chilean acts 160-163
 - Immediate post-treaty period 147-163
 - Irigoyen’s speech 147-153
 - Jurisdictional acts 183-189
 - Maps (cartography) (see this heading)
 - Valderrama’s speech 160
- Contradictory evidence 103, 122
- Dungeness-Andes line 92, 94-103, 146
- Eastern islands 111-115, 119-120
- Generally 84-147
- Geography of treaty 91-92
- Isla Grande 92, 103-105, 107-108, 116
- Islands and Tierra del Fuego 97-99, 119
- “Islands clause”
 - Argentine attribution under (see this heading)
 - Chilean attribution under (see this heading)

- Generally 92, 106-107
Preliminary issues 105-106, 127-129
Text of treaty 106
- Islands within the Beagle Channel 143-146
Las demás islas que haya 113-114, 117-118
Magellanic area 92, 96-103, 146
Oceanic principle 90-91, 112-115, 118-119, 120-121
Patagonia 91-92, 94-96, 102, 108-111, 113, 117
PNL group 78, 106, 117-118, 127, 141, 146-147
Prior history 81
Preamble of treaty 89-91
Protocol of 1893 124-127
Straits of Magellan 92, 96-103, 146
Structure of treaty 88
Table of contents 58-60
Territorial provisions 91-147
Text of treaty 84-88, 104, 106
Tierra del Fuego
 Isla Grande 92, 103-105, 107-108, 116
 Islands and 97-99, 119
 Meaning of 107-108
 Patagonia as 108-111, 113, 117
- Title of treaty 88-89
“Treaty” arm of Beagle Channel
 Conclusion 141
 Geography of channel arms 129-130
 Generally 131-136
 Northern arm as 136-141
Valderrama proposal 122-124
Western islands 115-116, 119-120, 141-143
- Cabot Strait 278, 280-281
- Canada (see “Case of the delimitation of maritime areas between Canada and the French Republic”)
- Cape Breton Island 275, 278-280, 282, 291, 297, 307, 326, 329, 333-335, 339, 341
- Cape Canso 280, 291, 297, 330-331
- Cape Horn 112, 115-116
- Cape Race 278, 280, 296-297, 330-331
- Cape Ray 278, 280, 326
- Cartography evidence
 Evaluation, principles of 167-168
 Parties’ own maps 167
 Temporal (chronological) factors 167-168
 Third-country maps 167
- Treaty between Argentina and Chile (see “Boundary Treaty”)
- Use of 163-164

- Case concerning a dispute between Argentina and Chile concerning the Beagle Channel 55-264
Act of Montevideo (requesting Holy See to mediate) 240-242
Act of Puerto Montt (establishing negotiation system) 237-239
Arbitration award (1977) (see "Arbitration award")
Boundary Treaty of 1881, court interpretation of (see "Boundary Treaty")
Declaration of invalidity of award 226-236
Declaration of nullity of award 226-236
Declaration of peace and friendship, joint (1984) 249
Editorial note 55
Exchange of diplomatic notes concerning award 226-236
Generally 55
Invalidity of award, declaration of 226-236
Nullity of award, declaration of 226-236
Overview 55
Papal proposal (1980) 243-248
Treaty of peace and friendship (1984) (see "Treaty of Peace")
- Case concerning boundary disputes between India and Pakistan relating to the interpretation of the report of the Bengal Boundary Commission 3-51
Appendix I 17-23
Appendix II 23-26
Appendix III 26-29
Appendix IV 29-33
Appendix V 33-35
Appendix VI 35-38
Appendix VII 39-42
Appendix VIII 42-45
Appendix IX 45-47
Appendix X 47-48
Appendix XI 49-50
Appendix XII 51
Bengal, East and West 3, 11-12
Bengal Boundary Commission, report of (Radcliff Award) 4-9
Decision I 13
Decision II 14
Decision III 15
Decision IV 16-17
Dispute I 11-13
Dispute II 13-14
Dispute III 15
Dispute IV 15-16
Ganges river 12-13, 14
Indo-Pakistan Boundary Disputes Tribunal 10-11
Kusiyara river 15-17
Mathabhangha river 13-14
Patharia Hills Reserve Forest 15

- Radcliff Award 4-9
Report of Bengal Boundary Commission (Radcliff Award) 4-9
Sonai river 16-17
- Case of the delimitation of maritime areas between Canada and the French Republic 267-341
Applicable law 282-283
Area to be delimited 278-279, 296-297
Arguments of the Parties 283-289
 Canada 286-289
 Contradictions in the arguments advanced 289
 France 283-286
Award 273
 Material error 273
 Objection 273
Competence of the Court 271
Constitution of the Court 267, 271-272, 274
Counter-Memorial 272, 274-275
Coordinates 297-301
 North American Datum 298-301
Costs and expenses 273
Dissenting opinion of Professor Gotlieb 324-341
Dissenting opinion of Professor Weil 302-323
Geographical features 278-282
 Corridor 302, 304, 308, 334-335, 337
 Coasts opposite the disputed area 280-281, 327
 Enclave 289-290, 306, 335, 337
 Gulf approaches 280-281, 329-331, 337
Historical title 282, 286, 339
Memorial 272, 274-275
Negotiations between the Parties 276-278
 “Summary of conclusions” 276, 296, 341
Oral proceedings 273, 275
Origin of the dispute 275-278
Position of the Court 289-291
 Southern sector 290-291, 333
 Western sector 289-290, 333
Proceedings 272-273
Representatives of Canada 267-269
Representatives of France 269-270
Technical report 299-301
Written proceedings 272, 274-275
- Chile
 Beagle Channel dispute with Argentina (case) 55-264
- Coast
 Adjacency 282, 287-288
 Archipelagos 117
 Corresponding maritime areas 287-288, 324, 329
 General direction 326

Measurement

- By general direction 326-327
- By segments 281, 325-327
- Opposite to the disputed area 280-281, 327
- Relationship between coastlines 281, 329, 332
- Seaward projection 284, 287, 289, 319
 - Frontal 287, 290, 304-306, 333
 - Radial 287, 305-306
- Relative and differentiated 284, 307-308, 319, 325-329

Commission

- Bengal Boundary Commission, report of 4-9
- Continental Shelf, commission on the limits of 292, 318

Compromise

- Between France and Canada 270-273, 278, 282
- Treaty as 88, 94-95

Contiguous zone 302-303, 339**Continental shelf**

- Commission on limits of 292, 318
- Delimitation 275 (see also "Maritime frontier")
 - Fisheries 293-295, 321-322
 - Mineral resources 295-296
- Principle of equal capacity of islands and continental countries to give rise to maritime areas 284
- Principle of the need to take into account the length of coasts 287-288
- Principle of no-overlapping 286-287, 307, 313
- Projection of coasts 287, 304-308, 319, 333-334
- Proportionality 288, 296-297
- Extended to the outer edge of the continental margin 291-292, 318-319, 340
- Geological *continuum* 279, 284
- Natural extension of territory 286-287

Convention on the Continental Shelf, 1958

- Article 6 (delimitation) 276, 283, 318
- Reservations 276

Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982

- Article 33 290, 302-303, 339
- Article 57 303
- Article 58 295, 322
- Article 76 291-293, 318-319
- Article 76, para. 8 292
- Article 121, para. 2 285
- Article 121, para. 3 284

Court

- In the case of the delimitation of maritime areas between Canada and the French Republic
 - Competence 271, 292-293
 - Constitution 271-272, 274
 - Contradiction between methods used concurrently 333-336
 - Membership 267, 271
 - Obligation to rule in accordance with the rules of international law 271

Customary international law 295, 318

Delimitation (see “Continental shelf” and “Maritime frontier”)

Dungeness-Andes line 92, 94-103, 146

Equitable outcome 282, 289, 307, 309, 312-313, 316, 336-337, 341

Exclusive economic zone 277, 284, 290, 302-303, 339

Equidistance 275, 277, 280-283, 287-290, 303, 316-317, 332

 In the absence of special circumstances 283

Equitable principles 280, 282, 324-325

Equity 287, 307

 According to law 312, 314

 Balance of equities 314-316

 “Fundamentally inequitable” 294

 International law 280, 282, 312, 314

 Proportionality and 288-289, 296-297, 309, 329-332, 336-337

 Spatial 314-315

Ex aequo et bono 316

Fishing 293-295, 321-332

 Exclusive fishing zone 277

 “La Bretagne” case 294-295

 Quotas 276-278, 321-322

 Reciprocity 294-295, 322

 Zone under national jurisdiction 277

Fortune Bay 278-279, 281, 327

France (see “Case of the delimitation of maritime areas between Canada and the French Republic”)

Freedom of navigation

 200-mile zone 295, 332

Ganges river 12-13, 14

Holy See

 Act of Montevideo (requesting Holy See to mediate) 240-242

 Papal proposal (1980) 243-248

India

 Boundary disputes between Pakistan and (case) 3-51

 Indo-Pakistan Boundary Disputes Tribunal 10-11

- Indo-Pakistan Boundary Disputes Tribunal** 10-11
- International law** 271, 280
 Customary 295, 318
 Delimitation and 282-283
 Equity 280, 282, 312, 314
 Historical title 282, 286, 339
 Rational application 322
 Reciprocity agreement 294-295
 Reservations to a treaty 276
 Sovereignty 283-284, 288, 313-314
- Invalidity of award (Arbitration award between Argentina and Chile)** 226-236
- Isla Grande** 92, 103-105, 107-108, 116
- Islands**
 Beagle Channel, islands within 143-146
 Cape Breton Island 275, 278-280, 282, 291, 297, 307, 326, 329, 333-335, 339, 341
 Channel Islands case 280, 283, 285, 308, 328, 338
 Equal capacity of 284
 Isla Grande 92, 103-105, 107-108, 116
 “Islands clause” (Boundary Treaty of 1881) (see “Boundary Treaty”)
 Las demás islas que haya 113-114, 117-118
 Maritime rights and political status 285, 319, 321, 337-339
 PNL group 78, 106, 117-118, 127, 141, 146-147
 Rock and 284-285
 Sable Island 275, 279
 Scatarie Island 279-281
 Tierra del Fuego and 97-99, 119
- Kusiyara river** 15-17
- Las demás islas que haya** 113-114, 117-118
- Magellanic area** 92, 96-103, 146, 261-263
- Maritime frontier** (see also “Continental shelf”)
 Delimitation 278, 297-298
 Arcs of circle method 290, 305
 Channel Islands case 280, 283, 285, 308, 328, 338
 Continental Shelf of the North Sea case 286-287
 Geographical factors 279-282, 320-321, 324-332
 Guinea/Guinea-Bissau case 314, 319, 320
 Gulf of Maine case 283-284, 287, 289, 294, 304, 314-315, 329-330
 Libya/Malta case 285, 287-288, 296, 306-309, 312, 314, 329, 338-339
 Line of delimitation 290-291, 297-298
 Relevant area 296, 310-311, 329-332
 Relevant coasts 281, 325-329, 332
 Socio-economic factors 293, 314-315

- Single line 271, 282-283, 285, 293, 317-318
Tunisia/Libya case 280, 310, 324
Line limiting the territorial waters of Canada and the areas under French fishery jurisdiction 278
Theory of special geographical circumstances 320-321
- Mathabhanga river 13-14
- Mineral resources 295-296
- Newfoundland 275-276, 278-280, 282, 285, 287, 289-292, 296-297, 301, 303, 307, 321, 327-329, 331-335, 338-341
- Nova Scotia 278, 280, 291, 331
- Nullity of award (Arbitration award between Argentina and Chile) 226-236
- Oceanic principle 90-91, 112-115, 118-119, 120-121
- Pakistan
Boundary disputes between India and (case) 3-51
Indo-Pakistan Boundary Disputes Tribunal 10-11
- Patagonia 91-92, 94-96, 102, 108-111, 113, 117
- Patharia Hills Reserve Forest 15
- Placentia (Bay) 278, 280
- PNL group 78, 106, 117-118, 127, 141, 146-147
- Pope (see Holy See)
- Proportionality
Between coasts and their corresponding maritime areas 287-288, 308-309, 329
Criterion and test 311
Equity and 288-289, 296-297, 309, 329-332, 336-337
Seaward projection of coasts 284
Test 296-297, 309-311, 331, 336
- Protocol of 1893 124-127
- Queen Elizabeth II, declaration concerning arbitration award between Argentina and Chile 224-225
- Radcliff Award 4-9
- Reciprocity agreement 294-295
- Rivers
Ganges 12-13, 14
Kusiyara 15-17
Mathabhanga 13-14
Sonai 16-17
- Rock 284-285
- Sable Island 275, 279

- Saint-Pierre and Miquelon 274-277, 279, 281, 284-286, 289-291, 293, 296, 303-304, 306-308, 319, 321-322, 324-329, 333-341
- Scatarie Island 279-281
- Sonai river 16-17
- Sovereignty 283-284, 288, 313-314
- Special circumstances 275, 283
- St. Lawrence (Gulf) 276, 279, 316-317
- Strait
- Line of termination 280-281
 - Magellan, Straits of 92, 96-103, 146, 261-263
- Territorial sea
- Extent
- Boundary line 277
 - Canada 276
 - Exclusive economic zone 290
 - France 276
- Tierra del Fuego (see “Boundary Treaty”)
- Treaty
- Argentina and Chile, treaty between
 - Boundary Treaty of 1881 (see “Boundary Treaty”)
 - Treaty of peace and friendship (1984) (see “Treaty of Peace”)
 - Compromise, treaty as 88, 94-95
 - Reservations to 276
- Treaty of Peace and Friendship between Chile and Argentina (1984)
250-264
- Annexes 256-264
 - Arbitral procedure 259-261
 - Conciliation procedure 256-259
 - Economic cooperation and physical integration 254
 - Maritime boundary 252-254
 - Navigation 261-264
- Tribunal, Indo-Pakistan Boundary Disputes 10-11
- Valderrama proposal 122-124

INDEX

- Accord de réciprocité 294-295
- Accord du 27 mars 1972 relatif aux relations réciproques entre la France et le Canada en matière de pêche 270, 276 à 277, 281, 321-322
- Article 1 294 (texte)
 - Article 2 276
 - Article 3 276-277, 294 (texte)
 - Article 4 276-277 (texte)
 - Article 8 290
 - Chalutiers 277
 - Coordonnées 299
 - Ligne constituant la limite des eaux territoriales du Canada et des zones soumises à la juridiction de pêche de la France 277
 - Pêche côtière 276-277
 - Pêche dans le golfe du Saint-Laurent 276
 - Projections des côtes 306
 - Quotas 276
 - Réciprocité 294-295
 - “Sur un pied d'égalité” 277
- Accord du 30 mars 1989 fixant des quotas pour les pêcheurs français dans les eaux canadiennes pour la période 1989-1991 278
- Article 2 282
- Accord du 30 mars 1989 instituant un tribunal d'arbitrage chargé d'établir la délimitation des espaces maritimes entre la France et le Canada (“Accord de 1989”) 270-273
- Article 1 271 (texte)
 - Article 2 271 (texte), 277, 282
 - Article 3 271-272 (texte)
 - Article 4 272 (texte), 274
 - Article 5 272 (texte), 274
 - Article 6 272 (texte)
 - Article 7 272-273 (texte)
 - Article 8 273 (texte)
 - Article 9 273 (texte)
 - Article 10 273 (texte)
 - Article 11 273 (texte)
- Affaire concernant les litiges frontaliers entre l'Inde et le Pakistan portant sur l'interprétation du rapport de la Commission chargée de déterminer les frontières du Bengale 3-51
- Appendice I 17-23
 - Appendice II 23-26